MINUTES

WARRICK COUNTY AREA PLAN COMMISSION

Regular meeting to be held in Commissioners Meeting Room, Third Floor, Historic Court House, Boonville, IN Monday, August 12, 2024, 6:00 PM

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: A moment of silence was held followed by the Pledge of Allegiance.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Richard Reid, Dave Goldenberg, Jeff Willis, Jeff Valiant, Amanda Mosiman, Bob Johnson and Greg Webb.

Also present were Morrie Doll, Attorney, Molly Barnhill, Executive Director, Carlie Render, staff, and Shelli Clark, staff.

MINUTES: President Valiant asked if everyone received a copy of the minutes from the June meeting. He asked are there any additions or corrections. He stated if not I will entertain a motion.

Greg Webb made a motion to approve the June 10, 2024 minutes. Jeff Willis seconded the motion and carried five to one with Amanda Mosiman abstaining.

President Valiant stated we also need a motion to notify that there was no July meeting.

Amanda Mosiman made the motion that there was no July meeting. Richard Reid seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

Mrs. Barnhill stated we still prepare minutes.

Amanda Mosiman replied gotcha.

President Valiant said it looks like we have four primary plats on the agenda tonight...three rezoning. He said as we go through these if the petitioner and owner would step up to the podium. He continued there should be a sheet up there to sign in. He said we will have you state your name for the record and we will go through the case and offer remonstration if needed.

PP-24-07: PETITIONER/OWNER: Arnold Real Estate Holdings, LLC by Bryan Arnold, Managing Member. Approximately 42.02 acres located on the north side of Doerner Road approximately 2,000' west of the intersection formed by Petersburg Road and Doerner Road. Hart Township 33-3-8. *Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024*.

Cody Simpson, Morley & Associates was present.

Cody Simpson stated the owner of this property is on his way and said he would be here in about ten minutes.

Attorney Doll stated I don't think you proceed.

President Valiant asked do we want to table.

Richard Reid said just table...

Mrs. Barnhill said Bryan Arnold is not here.

Bob Johnson said he's got two more to do.

President Valiant said he's got two more to do. He asked do we want to move to the next one.

Amanda Mosiman replied yeah, I am fine with that.

Cody Simpson said thank you.

PP-24-08: PETITIONER: Ukon, LLC by Daniel Ubelhor, President, OWNER: Maken Corporation by Daniel Ubelhor, Owner. Approximately 4.83 acres located on the south side of Oak Grove Road approximately 300' east of the intersection formed by Oak Grove Road and White Chapel Drive. Ohio Township 18 & 19-6-8. *Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024.*

President Valiant stated I believe this also has rezoning with it.

Mrs. Barnhill replied yes.

PC-R-24-06: PETITIONER: Ukon, LLC by Daniel Ubelhor, President. OWNER: Maken Corporation by Daniel Ubelhor, Owner. To rezone 4.83 acres located on the south side of Oak Grove Road approximately a distance of 300' east of the intersection formed by Oak Grove Road and White Chapel Drive from "M-2" General Industrial to "PUD/R-1" One-Family Dwelling. Ohio 18 & 19-6-9. Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024.

Cody Simpson, Morley & Associates; Daniel Ubelhor, owner were present.

President Valiant asked for a staff report.

Mrs. Barnhill replied on their notice to adjacent property owners we have all the green cards returned and they sent their notices out together. She said the zoning is "M-2" General Industrial and they are asking to rezone it to "PUD/R-1" One- Family Dwelling. She continues it is a fourteen-lot residential subdivision. She stated the Commissioners approved their street plans today and the Drainage Board approved their drainage plans. She added Newburgh Sewer sent a letter stating they have capacity along with Indiana American Water, so the plat would be in order. She said on the rezoning the lot size is 4.83 acres and our Comprehensive Plan projects the land to be neighborhood centers which would include low to medium density residential, community amenities and neighborhood commercial. She continues, the existing land use is vacant ground. She said lastly, the surrounding zoning and land use to the north is "R-1" One-Family Dwelling, being Berkshire Subdivision. She said there is some "M-2" General Industrial

and it is vacant...to the east is "R-1" One-Family Dwelling and will be the Cadbury at Berkshire Phase 2 and to the south and west is "M-2" General Industrial and is currently vacant.

President Valiant replied thank you, Molly. He asked do you have anything to add to the staff report.

Cody Simpson replied just reiterating what Molly said...this is a 14 lot subdivision adjacent to the west of Cadbury. He said we got road and drainage today, so we are here seeking primary plat approval first.

President Valiant asked Danny, anything to add.

Daniel Ubelhor replied I have nothing.

President Valiant asked any questions for the Board at this time.

Amanda Mosiman stated approximate size of homes you think will be built on these...they are small lots.

Daniel Ubelhor replied I am sorry I didn't hear.

Amanda Mosiman stated again approximate size of homes or value of homes.

Daniel Ubelhor said oh, they will probably be around 1500-1600 square feet.

Amanda Mosiman said they are small small lots.

Richard Reid said a third of an acre.

Amanda Mosiman said exactly.

President Valiant asked any other questions by the Board at this time...any remonstrates for or against this project if so please step forward.

Shane Irvin stated resident of 4972 White Chapel Dr., I do not see how this is possible. He said you have residential to the east of this entrance they are proposing and you have a residential going into the west of this that is already proposed. He said the Berkshire is the east...you have the already built-up Berkshire to the east and you have the currently phase 1 going into the west that is being built. He added there is a lake right across from the entrance to Chadwick, which is the White Chapel Dr., so unless that lake is planning on being removed...which I'm not sure if that's the plan or not... I don't see how it's possible. He said these lot sizes would be way small and, in my opinion, would decrease the value of the homes around the area.

President Valiant replied thank you, anyone else.

Cody Simpson said to touch on those points. He said this is adjacent to Cadbury which is a residential subdivision...Cadbury to the east of our proposed PUD so there is one hundred some all lots there. He added and then there is Essex's which is further east...these lots 50' wide are the same size of some of the lots in Essex's Subdivision so we have been able to build and sell homes on these size lots before. He said Berkshire which was mentioned is actually on the north side of Oak Grove Rd a little bit further west...and then Chadwick at Berkshire is kind of northwest if you will adjacent to this project.

Amanda Mosiman stated so to address his other question...you're actually not doing anything with the lake correct...it will all drain to that I assume.

Cody Simpson replied correct, yeah.

President Valiant asked any other questions for the Board.

Amanda Mosiman replied not so much a question as a comment. She said yes, I know it's a highdensity residential area and you have residents going, but you also have "M" zoning so please make sure that the people buying these lots understand that that is Industrial Zoning around them and has the potential to be developed industrial and not residential. She said so head off conflicts down the road.

Cody Simpson said okay.

Amanda Mosiman said just a comment.

Cody Simpson replied noted.

President Valiant said any questions or discussion...I guess we will address the rezoning first.

Attorney Doll replied yes.

Richard Reid made a motion to approve PC-R-24-06. Dave Goldenberg seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

President Valiant stated and moving onto the plat.

Richard Reid made a motion to approve PP-24-08. Bob Johnson seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

President Valiant replied thank you gentlemen.

Cody Simpson said thank you.

PP-24-09: PETITIONER/OWNER: William M. Burk. Approximately .407 acres located on the east side of McDaniel Drive approximately 350' northeast of the intersection formed by McDaniel Drive and Fuquay Road. Being Lot 15 in the Corrected Plat of Paradise View Subdivision and

Parcel 4 in Trey Minor Subdivision. Ohio Township 14-6-9. Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024.

Zach Boop, Kissel Land Surveying & William M. Burk, Owner were present.

President Valiant asked for a staff report.

Mrs. Barnhill replied the return receipts to the adjacent property owners we have all the green cards except for five and there was one returned/unopened, but we do have all the white pay receipts showing they were mailed correctly. She continues the zoning is "R-1" One-Family Dwelling and there is General Commercial in the rear, but the zoning goes by the frontage so "R-1" would reign over that. She stated there is no floodplain and the proposed development is to combine the parcels together, making them one lot to build an unattached accessory. She said originally when the rear parcel was created, it was done with a minor subdivision...and it was deeded over to Burk for additional yard only, but it's still a separate parcel so the only way to make it one lot and be able to build back there they had to do a primary. She said the street construction plans were approved by the Commissioners today for the request for no improvements and the Drainage Board approved no improvements as well. Lastly, she added sewer and water is existing so the plat would be in order.

President Valiant replied thank you, Molly...anything to add to the staff report.

Zach Boop said she covered it. He continues basically he has two pieces he wants to combine... he owns both of them so let's put them together.

Amanda Mosiman asked what are we wanting to put in.

William Burk replied eventually I'd like to put a pole barn...garage, only electric no water or sewage.

Amanda Mosiman asked what's in the "C-4" Trey Minor...I'm having a hard time picturing this spot, sorry.

Mrs. Barnhill asked what's in it.

Attorney Doll said what's permitted.

Amanda Mosiman said well no... I know what's permitted, I was just wondering what was behind him.

William Burk replied it's a daycare center.

Amanda Mosiman said a daycare okay, I know where I'm at now.

President Valiant asked any other questions for the Board at this time. He asked any remonstration for or against this project...if so please step forward. He said being none I'll entertain a motion.

Richard Reid made a motion to approve PP-24-09. Jeff Willis seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

PP-24-10: PETITIONER/OWNER: Schnur Family Trust by Margaret Schnur, Trustee, Schnur Brothers Farms IV, LLC by Charles E. Schnur, Member, Anne Downey, Marie Eisterhold, Jane Baker, Lois Mitchell, Beverly Newcomb, Mike Schnur, Susan Davis, Tony Schnur, David Schnur, and Donna Lasher, Owners. Approximately 21.51 acres located on the east side of Epworth Road 0' north of the intersection formed by Epworth Road and Vann Road. Ohio Township 20-6-9. *Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024.*

Cody Simpson, Morley & Associates; Attorney Scott Stone, Stone & Stratman, LLP were present.

President Valiant asked Molly do we have a staff report.

Mrs. Barnhill replied we have all of the return receipts from notice to adjacent property owners. She stated the zoning is "C-4" General Commercial and there is AE floodplain. She added this is a one lot subdivision for the purposes of splitting the property off from the rest of the field and to sell. She continues the street construction plans...they have requested no street plans and the Commissioner's approved that today and the Drainage Board approved the request for no drainage plans to be required. She said on sewer, Newburgh has sent us a letter stating they have lines in place, however a capacity study would need to be done, so I'm not sure that they would have capacity or if they will have to improve the lines at this time. She continues Chandler water has lines in place and ready for connection...on the plat it would need to state "not a building site, until future road and drainage are approved" ...they are coming back with more, but they just want to get it split off now to get it sold.

President Valiant replied thank you. He asked gentlemen do you have anything to add.

Cody Simpson said just to reiterate this subdivision is to sell this piece of property, so we are seeking your approval.

President Valiant asked any questions by the Board.

Richard Reid asked what did you say it was subject to...the approval of sewer.

Mrs. Barnhill replied sewer, yes.

Amanda Mosiman said yeah sewer and water.

Mrs. Barnhill replied water was good.

Amanda Mosiman stated for one not the others.

Cody Simpson said I believe that it was just the sewer, right Molly.

Mrs. Barnhill replied yes.

Cody Simpson continued that had the note about... all it said from my recollection, the note said a capacity study would have to be done prior to issuing a tap.

Mrs. Barnhill said yes.

President Valiant asked any remonstration for or against this project...if so please step forward. He said seeing none I will entertain a motion.

Richard Reid made a motion to approve PP-24-10 subject to the building site have a sewer capacity study done and the roads and drainage plans having approval. Dave Goldenberg seconded the motion and it carried 5 to 1 with Amanda Mosiman abstaining.

Richard Reid said eating into your farm ground.

Amanda Mosiman said huh.

Richard Reid stated again eating into the farm ground.

Amanda Mosiman replied uh no, actually it's a different issue...just want to keep everything above the Board.

Richard Reid said okay.

President Valiant said thank you gentlemen. He said now, we will go back to our opener.

Cody Simpson replied yes please.

PP-24-07: PETITIONER/OWNER: Arnold Real Estate Holdings, LLC by Bryan Arnold, Managing Member. Approximately 42.02 acres located on the north side of Doerner Road approximately 2,000' west of the intersection formed by Petersburg Road and Doerner Road. Hart Township 33-3-8. *Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024*.

Cody Simpson, Morley & Associates & Bryan Arnold, owner were present.

President Valiant asked do you have a staff report.

Mrs. Barnhill replied I do. She continues we have all the green cards from the notice to adjacent property owners, it is zoned Agricultural and there is no floodplain. She said they are proposing an 8-lot residential subdivision... is it still 8 lots.

Cody Simpson replied 7 lots.

Mrs. Barnhill said so that's been reduced to 7. She continues the Commissioner's approved their request for no street plans and the Drainage Board approved their request for no drainage plans, they do show septic soil test being done on the property. She added I do not have a sign off from the Health Department on those yet, but they have had them done. She asked have they been submitted to the Health Department.

Cody Simpson replied I can check on that.

Mrs. Barnhill said okay, so any approval would be conditioned on that. She added and for water they are proposing to use wells or cisterns, so the plat would be in order.

President Valiant asked anything to add to the staff report.

Amanda Mosiman stated yeah...

Cody Simpson said this is a 7-lot subdivision, kind of northwest of the Lynnville area these are 5+ acre lots. He said we received no road and no drainage improvements today at Drainage Board and Commissioners, so we are just here seeking for your approval.

Amanda Mosiman said all this ground was recently reclaimed right. She said like less than 25 years.

Bryan Arnold replied yeah, less than 25 years.

Amanda Mosiman said yeah.

Attorney Doll asked how do you know there is water.

Amanda Mosiman replied we don't.

Dave Goldenberg asked weren't you talking to the Town of Lynnville about extending water.

Bryan Arnold responded yeah, we are in discussion and are checking into the feasibility to tap in. He said I think it's at Petersburgh Rd.

Dave Goldenberg said yeah.

Bryan Arnold stated so we are in discussion.

Amanda Mosiman said without knowing about the water and not knowing quite about the septic, I am a little hesitant to approve...until we get all that squared away.

President Valiant asked any other questions to the Board at this time. He asked any remonstration for or against this project if so please step forward.

Bob Johnson asked Cody these are all going to be single-family homes.

Cody Simpson responded that is the intent yes. He said to note on the water, if you are asking about whether there is water there if they were to build a well, I think the owner has made it clear that he would pursue extending water from the Town of Lynnville if there was no water available to the site. He added so we would seek your approval knowing that information.

Mrs. Barnhill asked but we don't know if they have capacity.

Amanda Mosiman responded yeah.

President Valiant asked we were still waiting from the Health Department right.

Amanda Mosiman replied yeah, for septic.

Mrs. Barnhill stated yes. She added there is always cisterns, which is what they have asked for...but I guess that's maybe not the intent.

Amanda Mosiman said septic and cisterns do not mix well.

President Valiant asked what's the wishes of the Board.

Amanda Mosiman responded I say we hold off.

Bob Johnson said I tend to agree with Amanda.

President Valiant asked would we have an answer from the Health Department by next month.

Richard Reid said we just have to make it subject too...don't we.

Mrs. Barnhill replied you can do it subject to...I will see...

Attorney Doll said you can do it subject to, but there are multiple variables here...we've got septic systems, water capacity. He added this is reclaimed ground, I don't know what that does to the hydrology of the property.

President Valiant asked what's the feelings of the Board.

Bryan Arnold asked is water normally required for approval.

Bob Johnson responded yeah, it needs to be available.

Richard Reid said I think David acted like they would probably approve it from Lynnville's point of view.

Dave Goldenberg stated the town has been in active talks in the development of that and we have water going down that way we would have to extend the line...and that's what I do understand they do have capacity to do that.

Bob Johnson asked who is we. He said would that be the Town of Lynnville extends the line...

Dave Goldenberg said well, that is part of negotiations.

Bob Johnson said yeah probably not going to happen.

Amanda Mosiman made a motion to table PP-24-07 until we get sewer and water figured out for sure. Bob Johnson seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

President Valiant asked do you think we could have that answer by next month.

Bryan Arnold said we will certainly work on it.

Cody Simpson said thank you all.

President Valiant responded thank you gentlemen.

PC-R-24-05: PETITIONER/OWNER: Woodbridge Capital Management, LLC BY Roger Lamping, Manager. To rezone 1.609 acres located on the south side of Lincoln Ave a distance of 100' west of the intersection of Lincoln Ave. and Lenn Road from "A" Agricultural to "C-3" Highway Commercial. Ohio 26-6-9. *Advertised in The Standard May 30, 2024. Returned by Commissioners for reconsideration with a Use & Development July 8, 2024.*

Mrs. Barnhill asked do you want a staff...well

President Valiant said yeah well let's go through the staff report.

Mrs. Barnhill continues so it did go to the Commissioner's July 8 with no recommendation and a Use & Development Commitment was presented at that meeting where it was decided to send this application back to the Area Plan Commission with the full Board for further consideration. She added additional concerns were that no fueling facilities were allowed, run off into the pasture was considered and that signs are limited in regard to height, size and lighting. She said Commissioner Phillipe also wanted to see the plans for the building. She continues we have had three complaints emailed to us and those are in the back of your packets and were also forwarded to you all so you could read ahead of time. She continues and I wanted to read their Use & Development Commitment into the record if that's okay.

President Valiant stated that would be fine.

Mrs. Barnhill said so it would be "C-3" limited to the following uses:

- 1. Use of the Real Estate shall be limited to the following uses:
 - a. Automotive retail and wholesale parts and equipment.
 - b. Automobile, trucks, motorcycle and trailer sales, new and used; repair and service garages.
 - c. Automobile detail establishment.
 - d. Landscaping Business.
 - e. Sale and service of electrical and plumbing fixtures.
 - f. Sales and service of industrial equipment.
 - g. Sales and vending preparation operations.
 - h. Self Storage Warehouse Facilities.
 - i. Swimming pool supplies and equipment sales and service.
 - j. Commercial Woodworking shops.
 - k. Automobile service station excluding gas stations, excluding convenience stores and excluding facilities which perform automobile body repair.
 - 1. Business service uses including banks and financial institutions.
 - m. Professional offices for real estate services, mortgage financing, insurance, architects, attorney, accountants, tax consultants, engineers, medical, optometric and dental (including clinics).
 - n. A Single family dwelling unit within or attached to a commercial building.
 - o. Two Family Dwellings (Duplexes) and Single Family Dwellings
- 2. A 25-foot setback will be maintained along the south side of the property for all new buildings.
- 3. Exterior lighting on any structures shall be downward facing to direct light away from the residential property to the south and west and any pole lighting shall be shielded in such a way to direct light away from the residential property to the south and west.
- 4. Internally illuminated signs and digital signs will not be permitted on this site
- 5. Hours of operation of the businesses on the Real Estate shall only be open to the public between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m.

Mrs. Barnhill stated and that is what they have filed.

President Valiant asked anything to add to the staff report.

Aaron Miller, representing Woodbridge Capital Management LLC & Scott Buedel, Cash Waggner & Associates were present.

Aaron Miller said we tried to get a use & development that would fit kind of what we are doing for this building, but giving potential future if there was not to be an auto body shop keeping with professional services. He said that was our goal to maintain a quality service and quality

building. He continued our main goal that we had talked about was a gas station...we did pull that out per our last meeting we had with the Commissioners, so we wanted to make sure we got that clarified in the use & development. He added we had some concerns on hours of operation and we did address that along with the light nuisance with directing lights away from residential. He stated we went through the last time we were in here we were talking about commercial creep and spot zoning. He said there is commercial in the vicinity and some of those are Aces Auto Body, Naps Auto, Newburgh Collison Center, CRM Restaurant Management, Woofie's Pet Resort, Snyder's Auto Repair and Moran Distributing those are all within the vicinity of where we are looking. He stated the traffic concerns we did have this approved by the engineer of Warrick County and we did locate an entrance that was suitable for Warrick County and worked with our engineers there. He said wildlife...this is not a wildlife preserve that was an issue that was brought up...this is actually zoned agricultural but, in any instance, will not be a wildlife preserve by the owner's admission. He continues all trees will be removed for any future build and home owners can plant more trees on their own property if they want to look at more wildlife. He said the issue was brought up for drainage...this is not a drainage basin for all the home owners within the subdivision, it is a lot that is set up for future growth. He added the home owners had complained about drainage...if we were to be putting a building in here, we would have to have approved drainage plans from Warrick County so that should be a non-issue. He stated noise, noise compliant...we did add our times of operation which would be very similar to the operation of the body shops that are literally right across the street. He said property values we are building a high-end building so we feel like what we are doing will bring new construction into the area is a great thing.

President Valiant asked questions for the Board.

Bob Johnson said Scott, I thought I seen somewhere where this is going to be leased for 5 years to somebody...is that correct.

Aaron Miller responded we actually do not have that lease set up at this time...so we can not answer that. He added our intention is to get this approved and then get into the building and the leasing portion of this. He said I would hate to sign a lease at this time until we know where our future is going with this property.

Bob Johnson asked but is that the intent.

Aaron Milled replied our intent is to sign a lease, yes.

Bob Johnson said okay.

Aaron Miller stated we would like to sign a long-term a lease.

Bob Johnson said my concern is what it might turn into in 6,7, 10 years.

Aaron Miller responded yes, I understand that. He said we tried to add to our use & development professional services, so if any case it does not turn into the repair, that we do have other options for that building that would be within a professional service.

Bob Johnson replied I understand.

Aaron Miller said and, in the use & development we did alter some of the things that may have had concern with and I feel like some of these businesses would be a great business for that area.

Bob Johnson said okay.

Scott Buedel stated and the only thing I wanted to add was there was a comment made about the drainage and to the farm field to the west...just based on the topography of the site, this will actually all drain to the southeast corner of the property towards Lenn Rd. He added anything we do on that site there's going to have to be a retention basin down in that southeast corner that would handle the stormwater for the site. He said it will actually be cut in somewhat on the property and then everything drains to the southeast...so it won't drain to the west due to gravity.

President Valiant asked is there actually two lots there.

Mrs. Barnhill replied yes.

President Valiant said so what's the...use & development for the one lot...what's on the other one.

Scott Buedel stated it's for the whole property.

President Valiant said for the whole property.

Attorney Doll stated but you only intend to use one lot for the proposed...

Aaron Miller said for the proposed construction yes.

President Valiant asked so what's going to happen with the other lot.

Aaron Milled stated we don't have an answer on that. He said I don't have any proposed construction at this time.

President Valiant asked any other questions for the Board at this time. He asked any remonstrates for or against this project if so please step forward. He said there should be a sign in sheet up there...when you're ready to talk please state your name for the record.

Chad Bruce asked can we have another one, it's full or do I use the back. He continued Chad Bruce 4599 Lenn Rd., while we are waiting on that I will say that Mr. Miller did an excellent job of including everything except for a nuclear waste storage facility in his use and uh, use list there. He said I would like to say a few things to the Board here, I appreciate you letting me come back up here again. He stated some of the things we have to give reasonable regard to with a rezoning would be the current condition and character and uses that are actually in the area, the most desirable use for the land, and conservation of property values. He stated I live on Lenn Rd. just south of where this rezoning is occurring, and responsible, and I would underline that word, development and growth for the county, I am all for development in the county and I think that is something that all of us residents in the county are looking for, but you know we have zoning ordinances for a reason. He continued we want to make sure that there's adequate light, air, convenience of access, safety, congestion, public safety, conveniences, morale, and general

welfare that have to be considered as well. He stated this issue has been bounced back and forth from this Board to the Commissioners, who couldn't, I don't think, in good conscience approve this so it was sent back here. He continued and I'd like to discuss a couple of the inconsistencies that we've seen since the very first meeting with this Board, uh, a couple of months ago. He said I don't believe it should be a surprise to the petitioner that uh that their land was agriculturally zoned when they bought it. He continued we're not trying to stop them from building commercial stuff on a commercial piece of property. He said to me this seems like a back way in for an out of county investor to maybe try to grab some commercial property in Warrick County for really, really cheap that is not commercial. He said that is not our problem, he knew what it was when he bought it. He continued their haste in purchasing that property knowing it was unfit for their purpose is not a valid reason for rezoning, you know, notwithstanding their urging of the APC to spot zone the property. He stated now we know that spot zoning is only acceptable if it bears a rational relation to the public health, the public safety, the morals, convenience or general welfare. He stated this does not, it fits the definition of prohibited spot zoning, which according to the information the State of Indiana has is quote "The singling out of a property for different treatment than similar surrounding land that it is indistinguishable in character for the economic benefits of the land singled out." He continued that is exactly what is going on here, it is the singling out of this piece of land for Mr. Lamping and Mr. Miller's benefit. He stated if you have, I would assume you guys have an aerial photograph of the area in question. He said now their argument to this Board is that there is commercial property in the vicinity and he was very vague in saying it was in the vicinity, it's not next door, it's not across the street to the vicinity. He continued you have Highway 66 off to the side, all of the businesses that he mentioned were along and have frontage on the highway. He said now their argument to say that it is not spot zoning is a tiny piece of land, a little sliver across the street caddy corner from them is zoned commercial and is owned by CenterPoint Energy and SIGECO they have kind of a pipeline head there or whatever. He continued you know, no commercial structures or buildings are going to be built on that land and in fact just recently a bunch of trees were planted on it to further separate that little, you know, the commercial property in the back from the residential area that they're in. He stated if the argument to rezone is based upon that being commercial across the street caddy corner like that, I think that's a slippery slope because SIGECO and CenterPoint own a lot of commercially zoned plots of land in subdivisions so you know are we saying that just because it says commercial that we can change residential to commercial or agricultural to commercial, it doesn't make too much sense. He said um I think the rezoning of this property is cut and dry spot zoning and I think it falls under prohibited spot zoning because it is solely for their benefit, the area in question, he likes to make it sound like we are in a commercial area, this is the property in question, it's all residential, this is me and my neighbors, the property in question is right here. He continued we're talking about a residential area, no businesses, he's talking about the highway. He said a few more of the inconsistencies I'd like to note, at the first APC meeting two months ago when this was brought up, it was presented by the petitioner to the Board members that were here as basically just a large 2 car garage and a house, kind of place for Mr. Green, who is the proposed leaser of the property, to tinker with cars, he wants to downsize his operation and also do some woodworking on the side. He continued it was later pressed from him at that meeting, that it might be as large as 3500 square feet but that's almost 8 times the size of a 2 and a half car garage, but it gets better, it was later determined that this building, that it would be this building along with a home with a 2500 sq ft first floor footprint along with an additional 2 and a half car garage, but that also turns out not to be true. He said at about 7:00am on July 4th, Mr. Green the proposed lessee, he's kind of the

friendly face they are putting on this, stopped by my house. He continued his parents have known my wife's family for years, so this is nothing personal, great guy, what he shared during the visit was that information that was presented was incorrect, but their plans are a little more invasive than we thought, we're talking about a 100' by 50' building so I pushed a little bit further and found out that Mr. Lamping also wants a place to store his equipment whatever that is, which made Mr. Green happy because he said now I can have a place to store my mower. He said so that would be an additional garage built onto the side of the 100x50 building as well as the 2500 sq ft home as well as the 2 and a half car garage, this is not being built for a man who is downsizing or tinkering as we were told in the very first APC meeting. He continued so for some scale a 50x100 building is 6 times larger than my house right you know right down the road, not counting the garage, not considering the storage for his equipment, the home and the 2 and a half car garage, now hearing just a few minutes ago that we don't know what our proposed plans are for the other lot, we are talking about a commercial compound that has the potential of being built here for some out of county investor for his good. He said we were also told that Mr. Green might have one or two cars sitting outside that he's working on, he already leases a shop in Newburgh behind the NAPA if you guys know where that is off of 66 so over the last couple of months I've driven by a couple of times, so if this guy just has a couple of cars sitting around, no, it's a lot of cars just sitting around you know and the shop that he has there is a big shop and its way smaller than what they are planning to build. He continued the area in question they brought up drainage, the residents, my neighbors, are concerned not with, you know he kind of makes it sound like well all of our drain water, drains onto his land, what we're worried about is this huge concrete monstrosity being built that is going to, he can't dump his drain water on us. He said there is nowhere else for it to go, there is a creek that runs at the very back edge of my property up towards that property and over and out and across 66. He said that is where if we don't have, you know, if it's a singlefamily home that is being built on that, you got a yard this is taking part of that water and the rest of it runs off like it does now. He said you know, if you're putting a concrete, a huge concrete lot plus a 50x100 building plus a house plus a garage plus another accessory structure plus whatever else will be built in the long run, I don't think there's a retention pond big enough that he could build on that property that's gonna keep all of that run off that would normally seep into the ground from running into everyone else's properties. He said I just feel like with the inconsistencies that has been presented to this Board and to the Commissioners, it feels like to me that this is a back door attempt to try to get some cheap commercial property in Warrick County that he could just come in and tell you guys it's gonna be great it's gonna be this little thing and get approval and five years down the line we've got a huge problem. He continued like I said, I mean his land use agreement includes everything except for an airport, I mean there is nothing that couldn't be done on that property. He said oh there's no gas station, great but there could be an auto dealership or a huge auto repair shop, we feel like it defines spot zoning and that it just has to be denied. He said thank you for your time.

President Valiant said thank you. He asked is there anyone else.

Chris Tucker said my name is Chris Tucker my parents live on the west end of that property, um, I just wanted to ask you a couple of things, first the last meeting you said you sent it with no recommendations, I just want to remind you guys we had a 3 to 1 vote first, thank you. He continued this isn't about people building things in Warrick County, this is about taking a piece of agricultural land that should probably go residential, I mean I lived next to it for 50 years, it's been

there for over 150 and put a home on it, this is a community, there are families around here. He said on 3 sides of this property are homes, and you're gonna stick right in the middle an auto shop. He said you know I just don't see the reasoning behind it, there are 4 auto body shops on the highway or auto shops auto repairs shops excuse me, you're gonna intrude on a beautiful area of wildlife, horses farm animals I know it doesn't mean much, but they are going to be corner to corner back there; they have every right to take all of their property and so does this gentleman, but they are going to be right on top of each other. He asked you have several properties around here in this sort of situation, what's to keep them from going next. He said so commercial creep can happen and please cut it off at Lenn and Lincoln Road where it's been for years and years and years, and anyway thank you.

President Valiant said thank you sir.

Laura Markiewicz said hello everyone, my name is Laura Markiewicz and I am a resident of Lenn Road. She continued as he says pretty much right in it, it's across the street from me, um, I think the question has been answered by one of our fellow residents but I would like to ask if I may the gentleman that wants to work on this lot and build what he wants to build might I ask a question.

President Valiant answered your questions will come to the Board and then...

Laura Markiewicz said come to you sir.

President Valiant continued we'll have them respond whenever they get back up here.

Laura Markiewicz stated as I said I think the question has been answered but why this lot, why this property. She said there is so much commercial up and down highway 66 as he said and in those other areas and it is a residential area that is agriculture, I understand but I'd like to ask please that you not approve this for those reasons and for what I fear will happen in the future even though we have a list of what could be there. She said I still see buildings huge buildings with multiples business which are respectable businesses but they all need employees and we all know employees have cars. She continued so now you're taking an agricultural area that we feel is a part of our home neighborhood and you are making it a business area and I'm not opposed anyone buying that property and building but as it has been said more than once, why not a new residence not a residence attached to a multi-million or a huge garage and out buildings so they can put their belongings there. She said I think it has been proven today or said today it is due to it being cheaper to buy this land for commercial than something that is already marked commercial. She said I understand we need growth in our area but do we not want to hold that growth for our community also if possible. She said I thank you all for your time and all your consideration.

President Valiant said thank you ma'am.

Laura Markiewicz said I'm sorry.

President Valiant repeated thank you ma'am. He asked is there anyone else.

Tim Gehlhausen said I live on Lenn Road just a couple of houses down from it, and I've seen Lenn Road at least once a year in front of this property flood with water across it and if it's going to flood with water with an empty lot loaded with trees soaking up the water, it's going to cause a drainage issue. He continued in addition to the traffic right now, we have school buses that back up there from Sharon School I mean they're backed up every day for almost a block, now you're gonna add extra traffic its only gonna get worse. He said if it would stay residential the traffic wouldn't be changing and that's my problem with it. He said that and the fact that it will, having commercial property that close, lower the value of our properties and I don't want that to happen. He stated that's all I have to say.

President Valiant said thank you sir. He asked is there anyone else. After ascertaining there were no more remonstrators. He asked is the owner present, yes, ok.

Mrs. Barnhill said just making sure we have the owner present at the meeting She asked is that him in the back.

President Valiant asked are we seeing something different.

Mrs. Barnhill asked is that him in the back.

Aaron Miller said yep.

President Valiant just making sure he is present.

Mrs. Barnhill said so let the record show Roger Lamping is here, thank you.

Aaron Miller said we had proposed some sketches on the building and I know that these are proposals and they are not set it stone, but right now the shop area that we have proposed is about 3484 sq ft, the living quarters is about 2000 sq ft so they were correct on the size of the building, and like I said these are only proposed but you're talking about a 2000 sq ft house in all essence then adding a 3400 sq ft shop area.

Bob Johnson asked and that is all single story.

Aaron Miller answers it's actually a story and a half, so the footprint is a little smaller but in saying some of these commercial business in this area, the majority of them come off of Lenn Rd. He continued there are two that I named that the auto body comes off of Lincoln and 66, but CRM Restoration, Woofies, Snyders Auto Repair and Naps all come off of Lenn Rd, so when everybody said commercial on Highway 66, if I were to come to the Board and ask for a curb cut on Highway 66, what are the chances of that happening, it's pretty slim. He said I've tried to address that issue in a residential development on 261, these are busy streets and when people talk commercial, they can't come off the highways because they're not, because in most cases the curb cuts are not allowed. He continued all road or most business are coming off of Lenn Rd and Lincoln, now like I said two of those vicinities which are one in the same the auto body detail Double Ds or I can't think of what it is, and the Newburgh Collision center they are Lincoln and 66 but the

majority of them come off of Lenn Rd. He stated and that's what I have to address the issues of the location of that.

President Valiant said so for the one lady and just for the Board's curiosity as well, what's the purpose of this lot, just to someone selling that you know, how did we fixate on this lot.

Aaron Miller replied so the lot was available and the owner purchased it looking for some type of business to put on it.

President Valiant said so availability.

Aaron Miller answered yes availability and two the owner is a Warrick County resident born and raised here, he's not an out-of-town guy, he has several commercial buildings in the area and they are all very well kept.

President Valiant asked are there any further questions from the Board or discussion.

Jeff Wills said last month when they were here, they were talking about, it was gonna be the guy living there in his house, having a garage on site...

Aaron Miller answered yes.

Jeff Wills continued he'd work at it maybe have a friend helping or may even have one employee working with him, that I was in support of, but now with the use and development commitment he can have an auto company there, someone else can be running their landscaping business with 10 crews out of it, it's a completely different use than what we were considering last month.

Aaron Miller answered sure the idea why the use and development came available, if for some reason this auto body or sorry auto repair, fulfills his lease, we wanted to make sure there were other businesses that could take its place within a building that is there. He continued it is not that he's going to be running several businesses out of this one, we did stipulate that he does do some working on the side but his main business is the auto repair, the maintenance of the vehicles. He said if for some reason five, ten, fifteen years down the road he says guys I'm leaving, I wanted to have the capabilities and an owner of the building that we could change the use of that building within these reins.

Jeff Wills said if you have a landscaping company there it more than likely would change, you're gonna have what your five crews coming in working out of the 3,500 sq. ft. building, they park all their stuff inside but you're still going to have crews coming in and parking and taking work trucks out during the day and that would change the feel of the neighborhood as opposed to one guy working on a few cars. He said it feels like it's a different, some of the things on here would definitely be a different feel than what I feel one guy working out of his house would be, where he'd have a couple of bays to work on cars...

Aaron Miller said uh huh, yea.

Jeff Willis continued and this is, he's going to retire at some point and so what's going to happen 10 years down the road or 15 years down the road or 20 years down the road when he retires.

Aaron Miller said uh huh.

Jeff Willis said the whole neighborhood may be all commercial by then, who knows, but um most likely not. That neighborhood tends to need the road widened.

Aaron Miller said I completely understand and appreciate what you're saying, I do, and the what ifs are always what we always have to look forward to but that could be a pig farm, you know, as agricultural that could turn into a pig farm, there's a lot of what ifs that could come into play and I think we're coming and stating what our goal is for this building. He continued it is to give a gentleman a place to live and a gentleman that lives in our area a place to work also. He said I can appreciate what you're saying I even at the last meeting we said hey, let's limit the number of employees and we said 4 number was reasonable. He continued he ends up getting a little bigger and ends up having some part time employees come in to help him out, I was willing to stipulate to that for the what ifs but at what point do we come back if the what ifs start to come into play. He said we would have to come back based off of this.

Jeff Willis said right but you didn't stipulate the number of employees, if you would have come in and said 2 full time and a part time employee or whatever it's a different conversation because if you're going to have a lawn mowing crew, you're not going to have 30 people coming in there to go out and have 5 people to a crew or whatever.

Aaron Miller said and we agreed to the employee part of that.

Jeff Willis asked was that part of your use and development.

Aaron Miller said it is not, uh uh.

Jeff Willis said ok.

Aaron Miller said I think that really takes care of the what ifs that you're talking about.

Jeff Willis said right, that's my concern is that he gets ...

Aaron Miller said too big.

Jeff Willis continued again huge and it's ok we're gonna have his house, I have less a problem with that, and then he converts his house to an office and now you've got an even bigger business...

Aaron Miller said uh huh.

Bob Johnson said I kind of agree.

Jeff Willis said I think if we limit the number of employees that we kind of limit how big it could be.

Amanda Mosiman said this time I'm with you, what's going on... is it a full moon or is it a geomagnetic storm.

Bob Johnson said it's what it is, 5g.

President Valiant asked are there any further questions or discussions.

Greg Webb asked sir, are you still willing to limiting it to four employees.

Aaron Miller said we'd be open to that if that was an approved path.

Rick Reid said well, I oppose this because it's spot zoning.

Amanda Mosiman said and I tend to agree with you.

President Valiant asked is that your motion.

Rick Reid answered no, I can make a motion to deny.

Amanda Mosiman said we send it with an unfavorable, that's our only option right.

Attorney Doll said yes.

Amanda Mosiman said yes, unfavorable. (multiple agreed)

Rick Reid said ok, then a motion for an unfavorable zoning. The motion was seconded by Amanda Mosiman.

Attorney Doll asked if we want to take a roll call.

Rick Reid said let's just see how many no's there are first.

President Valiant said I'll ask a second time, the motion has been seconded, all in favor... all opposed. The motion carried 6 to 1, Jeff Willis opposed.

Mrs. Barnhill said one opposed so the motion carries.

President Valiant said the motion carries and will be sent to the Commissioners with an unfavorable recommendation, obviously they have the final decision.

Aaron Miller said ok, thank you for your time.

President Valiant said thank you.

PC-R-24-07: PETITIONER/OWNER: Country Gal, LLC by Lisa Freidman-Warren, Owner. To rezone 2.81 acres located on the north side of Oak Grove Road approximately 460' east of the intersection formed by Oak Grove Road and White Chapel Road from "M-2" to "C-4" General Commercial. Boon Township 18-6-8. *Advertised in The Standard on August 1, 2024.*

President Valiant said please state your name for the record.

Lisa Freidman-Warren said I am Lisa Freidman-Warren.

President Valiant said thank you.

Cody Simpson said I'm Cody Simpson from Morley.

Amanda Mosiman said who? (multiple people laughing) She continued never heard of ya.

President Valiant asked have we seen you yet today. He then asked for a staff report.

Amanda Mosiman said Lisa you cleared the room.

Lisa Freidman-Warren said thankfully.

Mrs. Barnhill said on their notice we have all of the green cards from the notice to the adjacent property owners. She continued it is 4.83 acres comprehensive plan predicts to be neighborhood centers, wait a minute this is Ukon. I'm sorry.

President Valiant said yea that is Ukon.

Dave Goldenberg said this is Country Gal.

Mrs. Barnhill said Country Gal, ok, we have all the green cards except three but we do have the white pay receipts showing they were mailed correctly. She continued it's 2.81 acres, the comprehensive plan predicts the area to be neighborhood centers and the land use is a vacant field. She stated the surrounding zoning and land use to the north is "R-1" One-Family Dwellings being Berkshire Phase 2 and "M-2" General Industrial and vacant, to the east is "M-2" General Industrial, to the south is "M-2" General Industrial and is vacant and "R-1" One-Family Dwellings and will be Cadbury at Berkshire Phase 2, to the west is "R-1" One-Family Dwellings being Berkshire Phase 2. She continued there is no flood plain and it has access onto Oak Grove Rd. She said the stated use is residential or neighborhood amenities which would be in compliance and fits with the comprehensive plan.

President Valiant said thank you, anything to add to the staff report.

Cody Simpson said just to reiterate, we're down zoning from "M-2" to "C-4" we are requesting a down zone and the kind of intent is that it could be a commercial node kind of like a general store or country market, the "C-4" also does allow for residential if that were to be pursued. The owner

is retaining some of the property adjacent to this as well and is committed to keeping this looking nice and present to the surrounding community as well.

Mrs. Barnhill stated I did need to also add that they're carving this zoning out of a larger piece of ground and so they are following this up with a primary plat to match the boundary of the zoning, that will come next month.

Cody Simpson said correct.

President Valiant asked any plans for the property yet or what kind of ...

Lisa Freidman-Warren said well, I have a total of 61 acres and so I have my approvals to do a forested wetlands bank on the majority of the property. She continued and I gave Cody a little map of where that would be, I have to get my LLC going but its approved now through Army Corps. She also stated and then the strip next to it is Oak Grove down to the park I'm planning a little overlook into the wetlands and a little path there, I'm going to retain that piece of land and also a barn will go on there and then the two pieces I'm carving out its just I'm trying to release some capital a little less asset, so that's what I'm doing.

President Valiant said ok.

Lisa Freidman-Warren continued and it's probably going to be residential, I just wanted to leave an option open in case somebody wanted to put a coffee shop in or something that would go in the neighborhood with the park being out there.

President Valiant said thank you. He asked are there any questions from the Board at this time. After ascertaining there were no questions from the Board, he asked if there are any remonstrators for or against this project please step forward.

Shane Irvin stated 4972 White Chapel drive, I'm a property owner on lot 66 adjacent to this property. I support Ms. Freidman-Warren's plan, originally, I know it was supposed to be a designated wetland and from what I see on the map drawing...

President Valiant said sir, please make sure you are speaking into the microphone, this is being recorded.

Shane Irvin said I'm sorry, that's right. He continued the original intention of what I saw of the map was a designated wetland and I do believe that is still the plan from what I've seen and I haven't seen the updated maps but the property owners that are along with me in the neighborhood I have 5 currently with verbal petition and I've got 8 more that would like to go along with it in agreeance with is as long as we have a plan to keep it in that wetland style of area that's really all we're asking for, we appreciate her and what her plans are. He said we just kind of wanted to support that. He finished that's all I've got to say.

President Valiant said thank you sir. He then asked anyone else, I don't see anyone else left in the room.

Rick Reid said Sherry speak up.

Bob Johnson said Cody's still here.

President Valiant asked Cody do you have anything to add to that comment.

Lisa Freidman-Warren replied I think originally when the wetlands bank information went out, we were going to include that, there is a drainage area on the border of the one lot, that would be on the western side, and the Army Corps did not want us to include that so that's been reverted back so that is just it goes back to what it originally was. She continued the wetlands bank I can show you is, sorry this is my hand drawing on here, if you can see the red and white dotted line that is the area of the bank itself. This lower part would be forested because that's what it originally was and this upper part will be meadow and it will preserve the area where the migratory birds go. She said the rest of this is I don't intend, it's going to remain raw ground for now, and in the future, I don't see anything but maybe sticking a cottage up there or something. She said so that's the plans now so I hope to move forward soon with the bank, it's been several years in the making, no one moves quickly in the Army Corps, so anyway, with approvals I can go forward. I think that's to your concern, the original plans included that ditch area and then there would be buffer along there so now it will just remain the same drainage area it was before.

President Valiant said thank you. He asked are there any other questions from the Board or discussion, if not I'll entertain a motion.

Bob Johnson made a motion to approve PC-R-24-07. Jeff Willis seconded the motion and it carried unanimously.

Mrs. Barnhill said so this will go to the Commissioners.

President Valiant said good luck.

Lisa Freidman-Warren said alright thank you.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Attorney Doll said I think we have an Ordinance.

Mrs. Barnhill said yes.

President Valiant called for other business, we have an ordinance to approve.

Mrs. Barnhill said uh huh, please.

President Valiant said since you asked nicely.

Amanda Mosiman tapping the microphone said it's sensitive tonight.

President Valiant said it is, I don't know what's going on with the system.

Mrs. Barnhill said well, at least we aren't getting all the feedback...

Amanda Mosiman said ok, good.

Mrs. Barnhill continued we were getting.

Amanda Mosiman said I'm like I feel bad for the person that's got to listen to this, every time I tap my pen you all thunk, (thunk sound) that was Bob, not me. (laughing)

President Valiant said so what do we have on the ordinance.

Mrs. Barnhill said ok, so, the definition for a home occupation which takes a special use and goes to the Board of Zoning Appeals, is only allowed within the dwelling so instead of, like a lot of people and it's for it's like a small business, a salon, they don't have retail they don't have customers just a business out of their home, well they do have customers, if it's a salon. She continued they've been getting a variance to do a salon out of their garage except that's not totally correct, so I thought if we added accessory structure to the definition for a home occupation, everything else would remain the same, that it would open it up for more people and it would fit with their intended uses instead of going variance after variance.

Rick Reid asked would that include storage sheds.

Mrs. Barnhill said it would still have to be incidental and secondary and would not be able to occupy more than 25% of the first floor of the dwelling or accessory structure, so it would have to be a substantial size.

Rick Reid asked so you still wouldn't have signs out front or anything like that.

Attorney Doll said no, no business signs.

Mrs. Barnhill said right, no signs.

Attorney Doll said we don't allow signs for a home occupation.

Mrs. Barnhill said no.

Attorney Doll said we don't allow signs.

President Valiant asked are there any questions, comments or concerns.

Bob Johnson said I'm on Board with this.

Amanda Mosiman said I'm good.

President Valiant asked is there a motion.

Jeff Willis said I like the changes to this I just I think our home occupation definition in Warrick County is just super stringent like you can't sell Herbal life or Avon or Mary Kay out of your house in Warrick County. He continued and I think that's a little bit too restrictive, I would have liked to have had time to talk about how do we address those kinds of home-based businesses that we can't have per our ordinance.

Rick Reid said most people don't get zoning for that anyways.

Jeff Willis said they don't but if they get caught, they could be fined \$300 per day or whatever, so and if they came in front of the BZA we wouldn't be able to approve them if they ever wanted to host or if they every hosted a party...

Amanda Mosiman said if they actually did what they are supposed to do and came before you, they'd have to be in violation.

Jeff Willis said they'd be in violation.

Amanda Mosiman said so it's don't ask, don't tell.

Bob Johnson (untelligible due to multiple people talking at once)

Mrs. Barnhill asked what.

Bob Johnson asked I'd come to you if I have a party.

President Valiant said if you're gonna sell Avon at your party.

Bob Johnson said there might be something going around. (laughing) He continued I'm ok with this, but I see what you're saying Jeff and I don't disagree I just don't know how to remedy it.

Jeff Willis said I don't either but ...

Amanda Mosiman said send it to a small committee and come up with some recommendations.

Rick Reid asked have we ever gone after someone like that, selling Avon.

Mrs. Barnhill said it has never been brought up.

Attorney Doll said we never have.

Mrs. Barnhill said we've not had complaints on it either.

Amanda Mosiman said yea, with the rise of working from home and home businesses.

Bob Johnson said in today's world you gotta make some money somewhere.

Rick Reid said that's right.

Jeff Willis said and if you do your books for your Uber you're probably in violation of home-based occupation, it's just whatever your side hustle is we don't, if you do your books at home, you're in violation.

President Valiant said I like Amanda's comment, it sounds like a good committee to uh

Attorney Doll said bookkeeping that wouldn't be a violation.

Amanda Mosiman said I'm willing to look at it.

President Valiant said in the interim...

Amanda Mosiman said I got tons of spare time.

Jeff Willis said right.

Bob Johnson said you want to approve this in the mean-time.

Amanda Mosiman said yea, yea I'll approve this in the mean-time, yea yea yea, I'm not saying in lieu of.

President Valiant asked did anyone make a motion on that.

Rick Reid made a motion to approve the ordinance. Bob Johnson seconded and it passed unanimously.

Mrs. Barnhill said thank you.

President Valiant asked if there was any attorney business.

Attorney Doll said nothing.

President Valiant asked Molly, anything.

Mrs. Barnhill said nothing.

Rick Reid made a motion to adjourn. Bob Johnson seconded and the meeting adjourned at 7:20pm.

ATTEST:

Molly Barnhill, Executive Director

Jeff Valiant, President